

MINUTES OF THE  
MARICOPA ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS  
MAG REGIONAL COUNCIL EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

April 18, 2016  
MAG Offices, Ironwood Room  
302 N. 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue, Phoenix, Arizona

MEMBERS ATTENDING

Mayor W.J. “Jim” Lane, Scottsdale, Chair  
Mayor Greg Stanton, Phoenix, Vice Chair  
Mayor Jackie Meck, Buckeye, Treasurer

#Mayor Gail Barney, Queen Creek  
Mayor Michael LeVault, Youngtown  
Mayor Mark Mitchell, Tempe  
Mayor Lana Mook, El Mirage

\* Not present

# Participated by video or telephone conference call

1. Call to Order

The Executive Committee meeting was called to order by Chair Lane at 12:03 p.m. Mayor Barney participated by teleconference.

2. Pledge of Allegiance

3. Call to the Audience

Chair Lane stated according to the MAG public comment process, members of the audience who wish to speak are requested to fill out public comment cards. He stated that there is a three-minute time limit. Public comment is provided at the beginning of the meeting for items that are not on the agenda that are within the jurisdiction of MAG, or non-action agenda items that are on the agenda for discussion or information only. Chair Lane noted no public comment cards had been received.

4. Approval of Executive Committee Consent Agenda

Chair Lane requested a motion to approve the consent items. Mayor Mook moved to approve consent items #4A through #4F. Mayor LeVault seconded the motion and the motion carried unanimously.

4A. Approval of the March 23, 2016 Executive Committee Meeting Minutes

The Executive Committee, by consent, approved the March 23, 2016 Executive Committee meeting minutes.

4B. MAG Intelligent Transportation Systems and Transportation Safety On-Call Services

### Consultant Selection

The Executive Committee, by consent, approved the selected lists of consultants for the ITS and Transportation Safety Planning on-call services, for the following areas of expertise: (1) Arterial Traffic Signal Operations, (2) Regional ITS Planning, (3) Systems Management and Operations Planning, (4) Systems Management and Operations Training, (5) Traffic Incident Management Evaluation, (6) Transportation Safety Planning, (7) Transportation Safety Training, and (8) Crash Data Analysis Tools.

The budget, anticipated to be considered by the MAG Regional Council in May 2016, includes a number of projects to be executed in the areas of Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) and Transportation Safety. These projects will be executed through on-call consultant contracts with qualified consultants selected in eight areas of technical expertise. A request for qualifications was advertised on January 28, 2016. Two selection panels, made up of ITS Committee and Transportation Safety Committee members and MAG staff, evaluated the statements of qualifications and recommended the selection of a number of qualified consultant teams, in each of the areas of technical expertise. On March 22, 2016, the MAG Transportation Safety Committee recommended approval of a ranked list of consultants for three (3) areas of technical expertise related to Transportation Safety projects. On April 6, 2016, the MAG ITS Committee recommended approval of a ranked list of consultants for five (5) areas of technical expertise related to ITS projects.

4C. Recommend Appointment of the MAG Economic Development Committee Arizona Department of Transportation Representative

The Executive Committee, by consent, recommended the appointment of Floyd Roehrich, Executive Officer of the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT), as the ADOT representative on the MAG Economic Development Committee.

In June 2015, the MAG Regional Council approved changes to the composition of the MAG Economic Development Committee (EDC). The composition includes twenty MAG member agency representatives, including the ADOT, that have one-year terms with possible reappointment by recommendation of the Executive Committee and approval of the Regional Council. On March 29, 2016, a letter was received from the ADOT Director recommending Floyd Roehrich, Executive Officer, serve as the ADOT representative on the EDC. It is anticipated that the Regional Council will approve this recommendation at its April 27, 2016 meeting.

4D. Amendment to the FY 2016 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget to Accept Funding and Add a New Consultant Project for the Rural Paratransit Needs Assessment Study

The Executive Committee, by consent, approved an amendment to the MAG FY 2016 Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget to accept \$60,000 in FTA 5304 funds and add the Rural Paratransit Needs Assessment Study.

On December 15, 2015, MAG staff received approval from the MAG Regional Council to apply for a Notice of Funding Availability (NOFA) for Local Rural/Small Urban Transit Planning Projects. On February 23, 2016, the Arizona Department of Transportation awarded MAG \$60,000 in Federal Transit Administration (FTA) 5304 funds for the implementation of the new study, which will commence in July 2016. The purpose of the Rural Paratransit Needs Assessment Study will be to address the needs of older persons and people with disabilities for regional paratransit services within MAG rural areas. The study may lead to future opportunities to secure 5310 and 5311 funding for additional work in this area. The Fiscal Year (FY) 2016 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget, approved by the MAG Regional Council in May 2015, needed to be amended to accept the additional FTA 5304 funds and to add the MAG Rural Paratransit Needs Assessment Study.

4E. On-Call Consulting Services Selection for FY 2016 Transportation Behavioral Model and Data

The Executive Committee, by consent, approved the list of on-call consultants for Area of Expertise A (Travel Demand Modeling): AECOM Technical Services, Inc., Caliper Corporation, Cambridge Systematics, INRO Consultants Inc., Lee Engineering, LLC, Resource Systems Group, Inc., Parsons Brinckerhoff, Inc.; for Area of Expertise B (Data Collection, Data Analysis, Data Management and Data Visualization): AECOM Technical Services, Inc., Caliper Corporation, Cambridge Systematics, ETC Institute, INRO Consultants Inc., Lee Engineering, LLC, MS2, Resource Systems Group, Inc., Traffic Research & Analysis, Inc., United Civil Group, Works Consulting, LLC, Parsons Brinckerhoff, Inc.; for a total amount not to exceed \$250,000.

The fiscal year (FY) 2016 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget, approved by the MAG Regional Council in May 2015, includes \$250,000 for on-call consulting services for FY 2016 Transportation Behavioral Model and Data. The main purpose of the three-year project is to update and further improve MAG transportation forecasting tools in order to better support new planning and forecasting needs of MAG and MAG member agencies. A request for qualifications was advertised on February 19, 2016 for technical assistance in two areas of expertise: (A) Travel Demand Modeling, (B) Data Collection, Data Analysis, Data Management and Data Visualization. Twelve proposals were received by the March 23, 2016, deadline. On March 30, 2016, the multi-agency evaluation team met and recommended consultants to MAG to perform the technical assistance.

4F. Amendment to the FY2016 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget to Accept Funding for the FY2016 ITS Strategic Plan for the City of Buckeye

The Executive Committee, by consent, approved an amendment to the FY 2016 Unified Planning Work Program to accept \$10,000 from the City of Buckeye, toward the budget for an On-Call consultant project that would develop an Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) Strategic Plan for the City.

The Fiscal Year (FY) 2016 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget (UPWP)

was approved on May 27, 2015 by the MAG Regional Council. The FY 2016 UPWP includes \$100,000 in funds for a MAG ITS On-Call consultant project that would assist the City of Buckeye develop an ITS Strategic Plan. The City of Buckeye will be contributing \$10,000 toward this effort, with the remaining \$90,000 contributed by MAG. An agreement has been executed between the City of Buckeye and MAG. An amendment to the MAG FY 2016 UPWP is needed to accept these funds from the City of Buckeye toward the budget for the On-Call consultant project to develop an Intelligent Transportation Systems (ITS) Strategic Plan for the City.

5. Desert Peaks Awards

MAG Communications Manager Kelly Taft provided an update on the Desert Peaks Awards ceremony. Ms. Taft stated that the Desert Peaks Awards will be held directly following the MAG Annual Meeting that begins at 5:00 p.m. at the Phoenix Airport Marriott, 1101 N. 44<sup>th</sup> Street, on June 22, 2016. She said the Desert Peaks Awards judging panel met March 29, 2016 to select recipients. Committee members were provided with a list of recipients at their places. Ms. Taft congratulated Mayor Stanton for being selected as an outstanding economic development champion in an extremely competitive category. She said the judges recognized Mayor Stanton as a key driver in efforts to improve trade with Mexico. Ms. Taft reminded the committee that they will serve as presenters at the event, with each presenting the award in a selected category. This will entail introducing a brief video summary of the winning recipient and handing out the awards for that category. She asked committee members to please RSVP to the event.

Ms. Taft stated messages will be heard from outgoing Chair Lane and incoming Chair Stanton. She said an exciting development this year is the Desert Peaks Awards will launch MAG's 50<sup>th</sup> Anniversary celebration. Ms. Taft noted that MAG has received about \$28,000 in sponsorships for the event, which is up from the previous year. Mayor LeVault asked the estimated cost of the event. Ms. Taft replied that the event will cost about \$37,000, including the venue, programs, awards, printing and labor costs. She stated that the sponsorships offset most of the costs of the venue and MAG pays for remaining expenses.

6. MAG 50<sup>th</sup> Golden Anniversary Celebration Update

MAG Communications Specialist Shannon Reed discussed plans for MAG's 50<sup>th</sup> Anniversary. Ms. Reed explained that MAG created an outreach program that will be used to feature the agency's long history of serving the region. She stated that the creative leadership at MAG has ushered in a legacy of 50 years of making a difference. Ms. Reed said to commemorate this milestone, MAG will conduct outreach throughout the year, kicking off at the Desert Peaks Awards and continuing until the 50<sup>th</sup> Anniversary, April 12, 2017. Ms. Reed stated that MAG will create videos, refresh and relaunch its website and increase its social media profile.

Mayor Stanton suggested that MAG focus its public messaging on why MAG is relevant to the community going forward and lessons learned over the past 50 years. He expressed concern that it not be a nostalgia tour, but rather focused on how MAG continues to benefit the community.

Ms. Reed assured the committee that the celebration would focus on the relevancy of MAG to the region with the theme, “Why MAG Matters.” She stated that the annual report this year would focus on how MAG collectively makes a difference in the region and how its members contribute to MAG.

7. Development of the FY 2017 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget

Chair Lane asked MAG Fiscal Services Manager Rebecca Kimbrough for an update on the FY 2017 MAG Unified Planning Work Program and Annual Budget. Ms. Kimbrough stated that the Draft Work Program was presented in incremental pieces each month, beginning in January, with proposed dues and assessments; in February, with proposed projects; and in March, with a first draft of the work program for FY 2017. She said that April is the last month for any information as the budget will be on the agenda for approval in May.

Ms. Kimbrough stated the first item for the draft budget update is a request for three staff positions for FY 2017. MAG is requesting an Application Developer I, Human Services Planner I, and an Accountant I.

Chair Lane asked if MAG puts its budget plan on its website. Ms. Taft stated it was not something currently on the website, but that it could be added. Chair Lane stated there has been a growing tendency by most municipalities and government agencies to post budgets. He stated if MAG has a new website in process, it is something that should be considered. Chair Lane said it is a good way to get public documents disseminated.

Mayor Stanton added that the City of Phoenix, at the request of the Public Interest Research Group (PIRG), does a checkbook-type dissemination of its budget. He said that every single expenditure by Phoenix is posted on its website, and it has been very positive for the city. Mayor Stanton stated that the City of Phoenix went from an average transparency grade by PIRG to an A grade.

Ms. Kimbrough said the next item on the budget is a proposed salary increase for FY 2017. MAG is recommending a proposed salary increase of up to three percent be included for FY 2017 and that any increases to individual MAG salaries be performance based. She said that retaining key staff at MAG is essential to continuing quality work. Ms. Kimbrough stated that MAG staff receive an annual performance evaluation every June and, based on their performance for the year, may receive a salary increase if one is included in the budget. She said the total proposed increase for FY 2017 would not exceed a maximum of \$250,000.

Mayor Stanton asked MAG Executive Director Dennis Smith how many employees typically get a salary increase and at what percent. Mr. Smith stated that MAG has 102 employees and some do not get raises because they have reached the top of their salary range. He said most employees would get close to three percent unless there is an issue. Mr. Smith noted that employees meet with their supervisor to discuss performance and job duties and that it is possible for employees to get more than three percent based on their performance.

Mayor Stanton asked if three percent would be the average for the performance based increases. Mr. Smith answered that three percent is close to what the average number would be. He noted there are times when MAG hires employees directly out of school, from another country or as an intern and this could be a reason for an increase of more than three percent. Mr. Smith stated that when MAG is processing H1B visas, an employee must be making the prevailing wage for the position, so that may be another reason an employee gets an increase of more than three percent.

Ms. Kimbrough said that MAG has gone years without performance increases. Mr. Smith said he heard from West Valley managers that some cities would be giving increases of three to five percent this year, and he also was aware the Regional Public Transportation Authority (RPTA) would be giving 2.5 percent, so he believed MAG was in an average spot for the amount budgeted.

Mayor Stanton informed the committee that his city is in the middle of employee negotiations. He said that Phoenix would not be giving three percent raises, but he would support increases at MAG and he trusts Mr. Smith's good judgement. Mayor Stanton noted that MAG may get caught up in the politics of the City of Phoenix's negotiations. He stated that MAG needs to be cognizant of what is going on in its member cities as it relates to employee compensation.

Mr. Smith stated as a point of information, this is the only increase MAG has and there is no other benefit package, such as telephone and car allowances, that other government employers have. Mayor Stanton reiterated that he supported the increases, but MAG should be cognizant it may become an issue.

Mayor Mook asked about identity theft experienced by some MAG employees. Ms. Kimbrough informed the committee that she believes an outside vendor may have had an issue. She stated she believes the breach may have been with an offsite vendor that processed the accounting system and had a backup copy. Mayor Mook said she wanted to know about the incident at MAG because of a new employee she has working in the security area. She stated she knew we instituted free credit checks for employees, and was wondering how that has gone and if there is a need for additional security measures.

MAG Information Technology Manager Audrey Skidmore told the committee MAG underwent several audits to verify there were no issues within MAG and provided information on proactive steps taken at MAG. Ms. Skidmore said MAG worked closely with law enforcement to support them in investigating issues reported by employees. Ms. Kimbrough shared with the committee that roughly 60 percent of employees signed up with LifeLock, an identity protection company, and said there have been no reports of issues since the initial incident.

Mayor LeVault asked about the FBI's involvement in the investigation. Ms. Skidmore confirmed their involvement and stated that she could provide additional information to the committee in executive session. MAG General Counsel Fredda Bisman suggested the committee put any discussion of this issue in a separate agenda item.

Chair Lane referred back to the salary adjustment cap of \$250,000 mentioned earlier by Ms. Kimbrough. He asked what the \$250,000 represents as far as an average of distributed money.

Ms. Kimbrough stated the \$250,000 represents an overall three percent increase to budgeted salary amounts. She said she created a spreadsheet that has maximum salary ranges and every position is being reviewed. Ms. Kimbrough explained she is checking maximum-range, number of years of service and status. She said when MAG looks at the numbers, the \$250,000 represents the total amount of dollars available for the agency performance evaluation.

Mr. Smith stated an employee can receive a raise of more than three percent, but the total amount budgeted for increases is three percent of the total funds for personnel. He noted that each year, MAG has significant salary savings. Chair Lane asked if that meant that one employee could get a four percent raise and someone else a two percent raise. Mr. Smith said that was correct. Chair Lane asked if overall we are talking about an average three percent increase with a cap of \$250,000. Ms. Kimbrough said that was correct.

Chair Lane told the committee he shared the same thought Mayor Stanton had, that salary increases could be a volatile issue. He said it may be more volatile in Phoenix than in Scottsdale, but nevertheless, it is something everyone will be looking at. Mr. Smith commented the budget is still in draft so if there is input or a suggestion from the committee of what should be included, that should be discussed during this meeting.

Mayor Stanton asked Mr. Smith about his mention of consulting with the West Valley cities regarding salary increase percentage in other cities. He asked if MAG consulted with other places as well. Mr. Smith responded that the issue usually comes up during both the East Valley and the West Valley manager's meeting, but that the East Valley cities did not discuss salary increases at their last meeting. He said he was aware that RPTA is at 2.5 percent and the West Valley cities had numbers greater than that.

Mayor Stanton stated that he is trying to be supportive of MAG, but wanted to find out if MAG had done an actual review of salary increases around the Valley. Mr. Smith stated MAG could review what some of the major cities in the Valley are doing.

Mayor Mook asked what the last two years of salary increases have been at MAG. Ms. Kimbrough said there was an increase of three percent in 2016, 4.6 percent in 2015 and 4.7 percent in 2014. Mayor Stanton stated in Phoenix, city professionals have taken salary reductions over a six year period and Phoenix is now in the process of restoring some of it. He stated he wanted MAG to be cognizant of the political environment in which it is making salary increase recommendations. Mayor Stanton said he was putting MAG and the other members on notice that labor groups are paying close attention to these decisions.

Mr. Smith noted Mayor Stanton's suggestions and stated MAG would contact the Valley's largest cities to see what increases they plan to make. He said that if need be, the three percent can be adjusted. Mayor LeVault wanted to clarify that assuming the three percent is adopted, that is three percent of the gross payroll and it is distributed based on performance. He asked if MAG typically used all of its payroll money each year. Ms. Kimbrough stated MAG will have a salary savings this year of over a half a million dollars. She said the saving depends on vacancies and increases employees did or did not receive.

Mayor LeVault asked the gross payroll amount. Ms. Kimbrough said gross payroll would be \$8.3 million. Mayor LeVault asked if that was the actual expenditure. Ms. Kimbrough replied that it was. She stated MAG hired a couple of employees, but that its towards the end of the year and she believes there will be significant savings. Mr. Smith said that some staff positions have been surprisingly hard to fill, especially accounting positions.

8. Legislative Update

Chairman Lane noted there was no legislative update for today's meeting.

9. Requests for Future Agenda Items

Chair Lane asked if there were any requests for future agenda items. There were none.

10. Comments from the Committee

Chair Lane asked if there were any comments from the committee. There were none.

Adjournment

There being no further business, the Executive Committee adjourned at 12:36 p.m.

---

Chair

---

Secretary